

# MAPPING DISCRIMINATORY LANDSCAPES IN CYPRUS: ETHNIC DISCRIMINATION IN A DIVIDED EDUCATION SYSTEM•

Nicos Trimikliniotis

---

## Abstract

*This paper examines the way in which the Cyprus educational system, primarily concentrating on the Greek-Cypriot side, reproduces discriminatory patterns via an outmoded and ethnically divided educational model, in spite of some efforts to introduce multi-cultural elements at local level. Existing literature and a number of studies and reports on immigrant and minority students illustrate the need for further research on the subject, so that a comprehensive reform of the educational system can take place to move from an ethnocentric model towards a more critically orientated humanistic education based on tolerance and understanding – a matter of urgency if Cyprus is to meet the challenges of a state acceding to the EU and a society, above all, that overcomes the current ethnic and nationalistic divide, be it in the form of barbed wire or ideological and mental barriers in the minds of its people.*

---

## Introduction

If the question of education in society is extremely important for society, the question of discrimination in education becomes even more so, given the role of education in reflecting, shaping and reshaping individuals, social institutions and society itself. This paper is a first attempt at the issue of 'racial' discrimination in the Cypriot education system, concentrating primarily on the Greek-Cypriot side. Of course what is ideally required is an overall assessment of both the Greek-Cypriot as well as the Turkish-Cypriot education systems as they evolved historically. The paper is part of a wider study covering institutional 'racial' discrimination and does not include the Turkish-Cypriot system, to be published *in* the future.

This paper is written primarily as a basis for further research, not as an exhaustive analysis of the methodology and research on the subject, but attempts to draw on existing research on the subject to point to the direction of future research on this important *topic*. From the evidence available (studies, reports, media coverage, incidents reported), it is apparent that the issue of *racial, ethnic and religious discrimination in education* needs to be placed highly on the research

agenda so that a clearer picture can be formed to assist policy-makers combat such discrimination.

### **A Classical Debate Continues....**

An immense role is attributed to Education by way of shaping individuals, institutions and even society itself. Moreover, the importance of education in the production and reproduction of discriminatory patterns, ideas, discourses, practices and structures is well recognised. Nevertheless, 'education', schooling and vocational training ought not to be viewed in isolation from the rest of society, rather educational processes should be analysed, as an integrated part, in a continual process of re-negotiation, re-articulation, part in conflict, and part in conformity with other social structures, processes and practices in society. Education, together with the labour market, is among the most vital areas where inclusion, exclusion, belongingness and discrimination can best be located and appreciated.

The sociology of education has maintained a long tradition since the establishment of the modern educational system. Education seized a central place in modernisation theories, embracing those of Weber, Durkheim, Parsons, etc. One of the most important theoretical developments was the Durkheimian theory of education. Durkheim considered modern education to be the gateway for secondary and one of the most important forms of socialisation. It outlined a process which enabled the individual to become a full member of society; the education 'offers' the necessary social and vocational skills, including the knowledge of norms and rules for living in a society. Even later post-structuralist scholars, such as Foucault (1972) recognised the importance of education as being one of the most important means of preparing the individual for living in society, although he called education a process of disciplining society.

However, this paper does not intend to explore the sociology of education, but investigates a part of that which is related to discrimination of 'the other'. Furthermore, this paper is concerned with 'racial' discrimination, *not* with *general inequality in society*, nor is it concerned with ethnocentrism; nevertheless to ignore the wider issues that contribute to the systematic discrimination of what is referred to as *racialised groups* in society would fail to appreciate the complex interrelation between discrimination and social inequality. In fact the very principle of non-discrimination derives from the principle of equality; to be (unlawfully or unjustly) discriminated against means not to be treated equally when one should have been so treated or, to be treated (formally) equally when one should have been treated differently (due to circumstances, social positions, knowledge, status etc.). The debates in the sociology of education covering the nature, purpose and meaning of education, the notion of the 'hidden' and declared curriculum, the issues of access,

denial, selection, the role of parents, parental education and interest, social capital, attainment, chances and barriers (Bourdieu and Passeron, 1977; Bowles and Gintis, 1976; Halsey, Heath and Ridge, 1980) must be modified and directed accordingly toward the issues of belonging and exclusion of migrants and racialised groups in society. Also such debates must be linked with the questions of citizenship, integration and multicultural and plural society within the context of the European integration process. Nonetheless, this is a long-term research agenda well beyond the scope of this paper.

The fundamental question here is whether education is an emancipatory means of human development at an individual or collective level, or whether in fact it is itself a mechanism or tool in which discrimination and inequality is reproduced and maintained. From the days of Aristotle (384-322 BC), education has been valued as a necessary 'ethical virtue' that ought to be properly implemented for the benefit of society and the individual. Aristotle in book Ten of his *Ethics* (1955, p. 310) writes:

*"Like a piece of land, which has to be prepared for the seed to grow there, the mind of the pupil has to be prepared for inculcation of good habits, if it is to like and dislike the things it ought."*

Aristotle can be seen as one of the first proponents of the virtue of education in its own right: to become virtuous one must possess a suitable nature, rightly directed by habit and education. Nevertheless, the key to a moral and ethical dimension of education is that it is capable of providing the necessary tools and skills to correctly discriminate 'good' from 'bad'. 'Discrimination', *i.e.*, differentiating an idea, matter, practice, person, from another and 'valuing' it, prioritising and, preferring or rejecting it, strikes at the heart of Aristotelian *ethical* education. For education is viewed as a means to overcome being a 'passions slave' and mastering passions on the basis of logic (Aristotle, 1955, pp. 310-311). Aristotle's seminal observations have filtered through popular knowledge to such an extent that they are now taken for granted as 'common sense'. In spite of the role of the Dark Ages, whereby the most accepted interpretation of 'education' was more or less equated with dogma, as imposed by the most reactionary interpretations of Christian faith, the notion of education as virtue in fact survived via the very institutes of church - state oppression in the monasteries' libraries: hence unveiling the inherent contradictions entailed within the very heart of the educational process in that 'knowledge' and 'truth' can never be guarded against or controlled no matter how those in power may try. The Orwellian *Big Brothers* and the various *Jorhe* (Eco's *The Name of the Rose*) can do nothing about it, but they will do their utmost to control, direct and use it for their benefit.

Education was taken up passionately by the Enlightenment and given a critical twist in the emancipatory project for saving, advancing and progressing humanity. Now education assumes an all-powerful role of emancipating the whole of

humanity. It is no coincidence that Saint-Simon allegedly professes that:

*"Our education achieved its purpose: it made us revolutionaries"* (Hamilton, 1995, p. 48).

Education indeed became a liberal ideal through which all members of a (democratic) society have the opportunity and capacity to evolve, develop and attain individual roles, jobs and positions in society. The Parsonian world preserved a special function for education in the socialisation of members of society via the *meritocratic ideal*. It serves also as a 'vehicle', a mechanism for belonging, and all western liberal democracies invest heavily in education: education is a good in its own right. The Marshallian citizens (and their children) can participate in civic life through education and the working class: Migrant communities and ethnic minorities would, therefore, 'belong' to the wider societal community; at least this is how theory visualises it (Marshall, 1992).

Before focusing on discrimination and education in Cyprus this paper briefly examines by way of introduction the problem of racism in Cyprus society.

### **Cyprus and the Problem of Racism**

If one is to understand 'racial' discrimination in Cyprus, one must appreciate the fine linguistic and cultural issues relating to the meaning of the key terms and the extent to which they are considered to be morally, politically and socially deplorable or repugnant. The concept of *φυλή* (Greek for 'race') is not redundant in public discourses not even in the so-called 'politically correct' media world. In any case, in Cyprus there is little sense of political correctness in the media language and society at large. The term 'race' can be and is being used without the inverted commas in spite of the fact that Cyprus has signed and ratified all the UN and other international instruments which totally reject the pseudo-scientific theories of race and consider the term itself to be totally discredited and therefore abandoned (see National Report of the Republic of Cyprus on the Implementation of the Conclusions of the European and World Conference against Racism 2002). Racism, in Greek *ρατσισμός* or *φυλετισμός*, is certainly deplorable, unacceptable and morally reprehensible as a phenomenon for Greek Cypriots and Turkish Cypriots alike and it would be fair to say that for the vast majority of Cypriots racism is considered to be a serious offence. Nonetheless, the dominant view, as shown in a variety of surveys as well as public discourses (see article further down) is that this 'bad' practice either happens elsewhere or if it is brought home it is Cypriots who are the victims of racism: Cypriots have suffered at the hands of colonialism; Cypriot migrants have suffered from the racism of the indigenous populations (e.g., in the UK, USA and Australia). More importantly the slogans of the nationalists in Cyprus who oppose a federal solution of the Cyprus problem, portray any federal system

relying on the notion of ethnicity to be inherently racist, as were the London Zurich Accords in Cyprus. The Turkish policy in Cyprus has been considered to be racist because the continued occupation of the Northern part of Cyprus both expelled and excludes 200.000 Greek-Cypriot refugees from their homes and, in the wake of Yugoslavia where the term 'ethnic cleansing' was discovered by the media, Turkey has been accused of following a racist policy that ethnically 'cleansed' the north of Cyprus from the Greek Cypriots and thus demographically altered the population by bringing in settlers to replace them.

There is no doubt that the Greek-Cypriots expelled from the occupied territories by the Turkish army in 1974 were victims of a policy that racially discriminated against them. Unable to return to and enjoy their homes, this argument is by and large used to undervalue and underestimate the historical context and nationalist politics of both communities, the roles of Greece, Turkey and international politics. Nationalist discourse which has been generalised as a state ideology through schooling and media coverage of national anniversary celebrations and national heroes, ignores the fact that between 1964-1974 Turkish Cypriots had also been the victims of violence, sectarian massacres at the hands of army and paramilitary groups, of generalised ethno-racial discrimination which forced them to withdraw into enclaves. There is literature examining the politics of memory, memorials and museums from ethnographic and anthropological perspectives; hardly surprising in a conflict-ridden island such as Cyprus, where historiography essentially mirrored the nationalist perceptions of history by both communities (see Papadakis, 1993).

Until very recently, any occurrences of racism against migrant workers were dismissed by the authorities as 'isolated incidents' - a policy subsequently attracting serious criticism of institutional racism or at least government inaction. The racism debate with migrants suffering at the hands of Greek-Cypriot perpetrators did not 'fit in' with the national victimisation story of Greek Cypriots. Of course not all Greek Cypriots are perpetrators and not all migrants are victims, but the power structure places migrants at the receiving end.

Careful reading of the *Second Report on Cyprus of ECRI* may lead to the conclusion that what we have is *institutional* racism, underlying the whole *legal* and administrative system, that is responsible for the employment and general implementation of the framework of entry and stay in Cyprus. The Report falls short of using the term 'institutional racism', but close scrutiny reveals a resemblance with the kind of structural practices associated with what Lord McPherson called 'institutional racism' (McPherson, 1999). As defined in his Report, point 6.17:

*"Unwitting racism can arise because of lack of understanding, ignorance or mistaken beliefs. It can arise from well intentioned but patronising words or actions. It can arise from unfamiliarity with the behaviour or cultural traditions"*

*of people or families from minority ethnic communities. It can arise from racist stereotyping of black people as potential criminals or troublemakers. Often this arises out of uncritical self-understanding born out of an inflexible police ethos of the 'traditional' way of doing things. Furthermore such attitudes can thrive in a tightly knit community, so that there can be a collective failure to detect and to outlaw this breed of racism."*

For Cyprus then, in all but name, the picture painted by the report is particularly gloomy, the underlying policy effect is indeed discriminatory as the ECRI report notes with concern. The inadequacy of remedies in some situations is mentioned in the executive summary:

*"Problems of racism, xenophobia and discrimination persist, however, and immigrants appear to be in a particularly vulnerable position in this respect. The rights of immigrant workers, notably domestic employees, are often not respected and the remedies available in these cases are not always effective."*

In fact the issue of 'excessive violence by the police' is noted in the executive summary:

*"Of serious concern are reports of use of excessive force by the police against aliens who enter or stay in Cyprus illegally and the detention of this category of persons for long periods of time pending deportation."*

The report refers to immigration officers who require training on human rights; to public figures, whose remarks may lead to a xenophobic climate, all of which induce the 'vulnerable position of migrants'. Also ECRI notes that 'foreigners account for almost 30% of the total prison population of Cyprus' and that in most cases, they are detained for offences linked to their right to stay in the country and very rarely for violent crimes. The ECRI report encourages the Cypriot authorities to conduct research as to the causes of the disproportionate representation of foreigners in Cypriot prisons.

Migrant workers themselves regularly complain about the treatment they receive from the police and other authorities, such as social workers, for mistreatment and racial discrimination.<sup>1</sup> The most effective means of screening has proved to be the Commissioner for Administration or Ombudsman,<sup>2</sup> as noted also by the ECRI Report. As with the previous year most complaints about human rights violations came from migrant workers: Out of 1999 complaints, 156 were from migrants – mostly migrant workers (Ombudsman Annual Report, 2002, p. 35) – and the tendency is for complaints to rise annually.<sup>3</sup> During the years 2000 and 2001 most complaints by migrant workers were against the Immigration Office and Police (Immigration Section). The Report notes that the sharp rise of 52.94% in

comparison with the year 2000, is the result of a tougher line taken by the administration to exercise control on immigration; the increase in the cases of violent abuse or violation of human rights against migrants, and the creation of support institutions to inform and assist them.

The Ombudsman Annual Report (2002) for the year 2001 is illuminating on the kind of practices followed by the administration ranging from failure to remedy situations of maltreatment to policies without due process to extreme harshness. Characteristically the Report (2002, p. 41) notes that 'the administration exhausts all the reserves of strictness' when it comes to implementing legal provisions as regards deportation of any migrant worker who loses his/her job, which is the polite way of saying that the authorities are harsh. Furthermore, the Report refers to the prejudicial situation whereby migrant workers are, in a very unequal employment relationship with their employers, and the Report is critical of the practice whereby the employers use the Police to rid themselves of their former migrant employee so that they may obtain a permit to bring a new one in, leaving no opportunity for the migrant employee to complain or put forward his/her case. 'The possibility of recourse to the Labour Tribunal or the Supreme Court is in most cases a theoretical one', the Report notes (2002, p. 41).

It is on this basis, after taking all the information available, that a reading of the 2<sup>nd</sup> ECRI report on Cyprus leads to the conclusion that institutional racism is structurally embedded in the legal and administrative system that racialises migrant workers. However, a great deal of research is required into the different areas of policy formulation so that any underlying patterns of structural discrimination can be revealed and tackled.

#### **The Cypriot Educational System: 'Communal' Education and the 'National Problem'**

Recent debates were sparked off in Greece, over the refusal of the school authorities to allow, due to her ethnic origin, an excellent pupil of non-Greek descent, Odysseas Tsenai, to be the prestigious 'flag bearer' in the annual parade. The convention stipulates that the student of excellence should carry the Greek flag, but this incident serves as a reminder of how ethnocentric education can be a major societal problem. Such issues are not confined to countries on the periphery such as Greece, but similar kinds of 'debate' have occurred in Britain over the Salman Rushdie affair and in France over the issue of the head scarf. However, these matters are not far distant phenomena from Cyprus, as a Tsenai phenomenon may well be repeated on the island.<sup>4</sup>

Given the importance of education in the production, and particularly

reproduction in the shaping and the reshaping of 'national' sentiments, prejudice, racial stereotypes, myths, discourses and attitudes about ethnic minorities, migrants and the 'other', whatever shape such education takes, it is remarkable that so little empirical and theoretical research has taken place in Cyprus. Recently however some important initiatives have been made and research has been conducted as a result of the growth in influence of the peace and bi-communal movement in Cyprus,<sup>5</sup> the presence of migrant workers for a decade now, and the processes of accession to the EU. An important development is the appointment, by the Ministry of Education, of a commission of academics and experts with a mandate to explore educational reform in Cyprus, and interesting debates are at last beginning to emerge. Nonetheless, the material available is still fragmentary and research is still in its infancy. The importance of the 'historical' context of education in Cyprus is that it is ever-present: the structure of the educational system determines the current basis of educational policy, the content of education (through the syllabi) and the structural links between religion, national belonging, racial exclusion and structural discrimination.

The specific historical setting of Cyprus has been dominated by the ethnic relations between the two constitutionally recognised communities, the Greek- and Turkish-Cypriots, as well as the role of foreign forces, something also reflected in the research agenda on Cyprus. The result is that somehow this has led to the neglect of studies on the various grounds of discrimination being initiated. Indeed, tackling discrimination on grounds other than ethnic or racial origin has been subsumed in the 'national question'; even the emphasis here has been to study the relations between the two communities, undervaluing discrimination as such, or looking at the treatment of smaller minorities.

The problems in the relations between the two communities began immediately after the establishment of the newly formed Republic in 1960; in fact the first inter-communal incidents started after 1957. The constitution imposed was extremely rigid and complicated and it quickly led to conflict between both communities, as the Report of the UN special envoy Mr Galo Plaza<sup>6</sup> makes clear. The social life of the two communities, including the question of discrimination, was inevitably shaped by the turbulent political history of the island that initially brought the two communities into conflict. There has been very little research on the question of discrimination as such, given the apparent dominance of the political question and widespread ethnic violence. The Plaza Report refers to the underlying ethnic divisions and the fact that individual human rights, including the right not to be discriminated against, was deficient between 1960 and 1965. Under the heading 'The protection of individual and minority rights', Mr. Plaza noted the difficulty in applying the principle of equality of treatment and human rights without discrimination due to 'the fact that the population of the island continues to consist of two principal ethnic communities, the



further fact that they are unequal in numbers and finally the gravity of the conflict which has developed between them'. The same Report noted the difficulty involved in the task of rebuilding a 'progressive re-birth of confidence and the re-establishment of social peace', as the obstacles 'are no less psychological than political.'<sup>7</sup> The way forward in Cyprus according to the Report is 'the establishment of the most rigorous guarantees of human rights and safeguards against discrimination', which goes to illustrate, if in an indirect manner, the prevalence of discriminatory practices that inevitably go hand-in-hand with the ethnic conflict and turbulence that existed, particularly during the period 1963-1967, but *also* throughout the short life of the Cyprus Republic.

According to the Cyprus constitution educational matters are classified as 'personal laws' and are thus left to each of the communities to regulate under the Communal Chambers. In fact education had been divided under British colonial rule, which embraced and 'modernised' the Ottoman *millet* system, which allowed separate education on the basis of religion, under the leadership of the Orthodox Church. The Church or the '*Ethnarchy*' was a traditional political leader, whose head, the Archbishop, led the flock under the millet system. During British colonialism, 'liberal' educational policies on the one hand and ultimate authoritarianism entailed in the colonial system on the other, created the conditions for the growth and evolution of nationalism and the subsequent clash of Greek and Turkish nationalisms in Cyprus, the conflicting national projects of *Enosis* and *Taksim* (Attalides, 1979). In any case it is well documented that the educational system was crucial in the spreading of nationalism (Anthias and Ayres, 1983; Grecos, 1991), due to the segregated schooling as well as the fact that personnel and school literature were imported from the 'mother-countries', i.e., mainland Greece and Turkey (Attalides, 1979; Anthias, 1987).

The term 'Community' is rigidly defined in Article 2 of the Cyprus Constitution, leaving little room for ambiguity and choice for that matter. There are two *communities* in Cyprus - the Greek and the Turkish communities. Art. 2(1) provides:

*"The Greek community comprises of all citizens of the Republic who are of Greek origin and whose mother tongue is Greek or who share the Greek cultural traditions or who are members of the Greek-orthodox Church."*

Article 2(2) defines the Turkish Cypriot community:

*"The Turkish community comprises of all citizens of the Republic who are of Turkish origin and whose mother tongue is Turkish or who share the Turkish cultural traditions or who are Mos/ems."*

The rigidity of the Constitution fixes ethnic identity in such a way that the two

communities must be kept apart. Anyone not belonging to either of the two categories, such as members of smaller 'religious groups', fall under the category defined by Art. 2(3) and includes Maronites, Latins and Armenians, who must opt to belong to either of the two main communities<sup>8</sup> and be subject to the 'Communal Chamber'.<sup>9</sup> The term 'community' is rare in constitutional texts but it is not unique in the Cyprus constitution.<sup>10</sup> From the other minorities in Cyprus, who enjoyed certain minority rights, particularly religious rights, but were forced in 1960 to choose one of the two main communities with whom they would prefer to align. Maronite's, Armenian's<sup>11</sup> and Latin's chose to be part of the Greek-Cypriot community, whilst still retaining their religious representatives in the House of Parliament, albeit with merely an observer and consultancy status (see Grecos, 1990, pp. 390-396). The few Cypriot Jews are said to have also chosen to be part of the Greek-Cypriot community (Dickstein, 2001; see also Pantelides, 2003). The Roma population of Cyprus, which is said to have numbered over a thousand, chose in 1960 to be part of the Turkish-Cypriot community due to their Muslim faith (Williams, 2000; Kyrris, 1969, 1985). A future federal arrangement can accommodate for different ethnic groups – women and 'minorities within minorities' – by utilising the experiences and regimes developed elsewhere, without of course dogmatically 'importing' regimes that do not account for the conditions of the island.<sup>12</sup> The problem of ethno-centric education, particularly the communal type which is the one opted for in the case of Cyprus, becomes even more complicated with the introduction of the migrant communities, who are themselves entitled to their own cultural rights.

The turbulent political history inevitably shaped the social life of Cyprus and as such the question of ethnic/racial discrimination during the period of independence up to 1974 is best viewed in this light. It is not surprising that the political question and widespread ethnic violence has overwhelmed the research agenda leaving little research interest for issues such as racial discrimination. When it comes to racism, racial discrimination, structural or ideological, the case of Cyprus is a peculiar one, as the problem of racism must somehow be linked to one of a long-drawn conflict, which since the 1950s, has taken the form of 'ethnic conflict', and what Azar (1986) termed as 'protracted social conflict'. The 'Cyprus problem' must be connected to the attitudes, practices and discourses in the daily lives of ordinary persons, viewed not just today, but also in an historical perspective. It does not take a genius to realise that underlying the historical so-called 'ethnic conflict' lay the politics of ethno-racial segregation. It is experienced in the 'everyday life' of individuals from both communities who happen to 'cross over' in their daily exchanges, some form of discrimination, ranging from prejudice to abuse, even to violence and murder by extremists on both sides. However, there is strong evidence illustrating chronic discriminatory practices from the early days of the Republic (see Plaza, 1965).<sup>13</sup> The difficulty is that the 'Cyprus problem' is primarily a problem of nationalism and

state/ethnic conflict and one ought not to conflate 'racism' into 'nationalism' and vice-a-versa, retaining the analytical categories that describe connected but separate phenomena.<sup>14</sup>

As one observer noted, the history of Greek-Cypriot education is a strong case of 'using education for political end', in other words the legitimisation of Hellenocentric education (Persianis, 1996, p. 26). Turkish-Cypriot education mirrored this. The Ministry of Education and Culture was introduced only after the constitutional crisis of 1963; even today its existence is based on the 'doctrine of necessity', due to the withdrawal of the Turkish Cypriots from the administration, in 1963, which was a requirement by the Constitution (see Persianis, 1996). At the heart of Cypriot education lies the ethnocentric model, a major structural problem and a barrier in properly tackling discrimination in education particularly against migrants and minority groups. The second major structural barrier is the social position of (subaltern) migrants and other marginalized groups, as noted in one study (Trimikliniotis, 2001a, pp. 17-50). *Social position* refers to the combined effect of the way these groups are being stratified in society (economic, class, 'racial', cultural and legal status), all of which are issues considered in this study.

In the territory under the control of the Cyprus Republic (south) there are no schools, even though there are in the region of two-hundred Turkish Cypriots living there (see Kyle, 1997; ECRI, 2001). However, there are Turkish-Cypriot children in the south, particularly in the Turkish sector of Lemesos, some of whom attend Greek schools; other Turkish-Cypriot children, who arrived very recently from the occupied territories in the north and do not speak Greek, do not attend the school. Apparently for the past year there has been an approved budget of about 11.000 euros for elementary schooling of Turkish Cypriots in the south but this has yet to materialise.

#### **Cypriot Communal Education: Basis for Ethnic Discrimination?**

The ethnocentrism of the Cypriot education system is well documented, as well as the influence of divisive separate educational structures along ethnic communal lines. This paper will not embark on a full-blown review of literature on the matter, as the subject for concern here is not ethnocentrism but discrimination – even though there is a strong link between the two: ethnocentrism is itself a source of discriminatory practice and ideology and thus is empirically – and theoretically well established. Instead, this paper offers an indicative literature review in order to locate both the 'gaps' of knowledge as well as the 'bridges' upon which the knowledge around educational discrimination is to be built.

One of the most important areas of research is by Karagiorges (1986), who points out from the outset that:

*"The dominant features in educational terms of the period immediately following independence were the exacerbation of the separation - along communal lines resulting in the organisation of education under Greek and Turkish communal Chambers."*

Karagiorges' splendid historical study charts the development of education in Cyprus – the resistance of the establishment to setting up a university and the influence of the conflict in Cyprus between the Greek- and Turkish-Cypriot political elites over *Enosis* and *Taksim*. In fact the separate education structures 'under which the education system of the newly born republic functioned, looked towards their respective mother countries for educational policies, objectives and orientation' lead him to the critical conclusion:

*"It would not perhaps be an exaggeration if one maintained that education not only did not support but it undermined the very existence of the State which it was meant to serve"* (1986, p. 152).

Karagiorges looks towards future policy-making so that Cyprus might be able to overcome the reproduction of national Chauvinism via education and avoid copying everything from Athens:

*"Chauvinism and intolerance in education proved to be destructive for the island as a state and for all its communities. Education must support the existence of the state an independent sovereign state and cultivate tolerance, acceptance and democratic procedures and responsibility"* (1986, p. 155).

In contrast with Karagiorges another Greek Cypriot educationalist, Maretheftis (1992), who is keen to bring out the Greek virtues of society, proposes a quite different problematic from a so-called Hellenic-Christian ideal's perspective. Under the heading 'The National Mission of the Cypriot teacher', the then Director of the Pedagogical Academy of Cyprus, Mr. Maratheftis<sup>15</sup> takes the view that:

*"Even though the teacher is a product of the society to whom he belongs, society itself requires that the teacher be distinguished in terms of moral and national consciousness. Irrespective of any ethos society has, society requires that the teacher is the articulator (εΚq,παOTf/<;) of the virtue and a fighter for the preservation of its national and cultural traditions"* (Maratheftis, 1992, p. 142).

Interestingly, the Director compares the 'easy task' of 'implanting to the students the love for Greece and the passion for *Enosis*' (1992. p. 193) to the current situation, which is much harder as 'the national task of education is to implant the idea of a unified and independent Cypriot Republic'. Castigating the fact that 'politics divide', he strongly supports 'national issues unite', following the usual tune

of 'national unity' and criticising indifference. Another interesting feature is the complete absence of the Turkish Cypriots from the process; whilst the Turkish occupying forces are there the points of reference are Hellenism and Christianity.

There are, of course, plenty of Greek books written on the subject of education and its relation to 'national' and 'ethnic' processes. The role of education (Greek education) in mystifying the social relations and conflict in society and 'national reproduction' (see Milios, 1984) as well as the processes of homogenization of the Hellenic 'social formation' (Milios, 2000). These works are mentioned due to the need to examine critically the Greek education system and content and illustrate the influence of Greek-Cypriot education. Frangoudaki and Dragona's work, *What is our Country* – a study of ethnocentrism in education (Frangoudaki and Dragona and Associates, 1997) is a seminal work which examines the national curricula and its role in cultivating 'patriotism' by empirically investigating the processes and means a viable 'national identity' is being reproduced through historical and reified perception of time, history and social evolution of 'Greekness' in textbooks, historical paradigms and the representation of the 'self' and the 'other'. It is, in fact, a major study on Greek ethnocentrism that applies also to Cyprus, as most of the books are Greek imported and education is Helleno-centric. Of course some modifications are required to relate these ideas to the Cypriot context but overall the analysis in equality is applicable to Cyprus.

Nevertheless, the question of (ethnic) discrimination is quite distinct and warrants separate analysis: Discrimination as such, derived from ethnocentrism, or from the ethnic or social structures and ideology has never been a subject of study in Cyprus. Specific measures, guides and action can be taken so that anti-racism and anti-discrimination can be introduced into schooling within and beyond the national curricula (see Tsiakalos, 2000).

### **Structural Racism and Schooling in Cyprus**

The second ECRI Report on Cyprus (2001) makes a number of recommendations that derive from an assessment of the current situation in Cyprus in the area of education, which provide a good starting point of analysis, not only in the direction of policy-making to remedy the situation, but in order to properly analyse the current state of affairs. The ECRI Report, under the heading G. *Education and awareness raising* recommends that the Cypriot authorities promote human rights awareness in schools and devote particular attention to the fight against racial prejudice, respect for difference and promotion of tolerance as well as to extending the curricula of all school children to include education in human rights. Furthermore, considering the increasingly multicultural composition of the student population in Cypriot schools, ECRI urges the Cypriot authorities first, to ensure that all teachers

are properly trained to teach in a multicultural environment and secondly, to react to any manifestations of racism or discriminatory attitudes in schools. Moreover, ECRI stresses the importance of initiatives in the field of education specifically aimed at facilitating better understanding between the Greek- and Turkish-Cypriot communities and supporting bi-communal events involving both students and adults.

Under the heading '*Access to public services - Access to education*' ECRI 'encourages the authorities to ensure that the provision of Greek as a second language meets the demands of the immigrant community and that teachers are properly trained in this respect', considering 'the increasing numbers of immigrant children in Cypriot schools'. Furthermore, it urges the authorities to consider introducing 'teaching in languages other than Greek for students of non-Greek mother tongue in parallel with education in Greek to facilitate the process of learning for these students' (see point 27, ECRI Report, 2001).

Tables 1 - 6 (shown at end of article) are indicative of the numbers of minority, non-Greek. They do not cover *ethnic background* as such but do provide a good basis for analysis. There are no statistics recorded, and no information available regarding school performance, ethnic/religious backgrounds or other relevant material. Neither are there performance records of the children from ethnic or religious backgrounds. From interviews with teachers we are told that pupils from Russian or Slavic backgrounds are generally very good at school, whilst many children of Greek Pontian origin, most of whom have emigrated from the former Soviet Union, do have some problems,<sup>16</sup> and most Pontians and other ethnic groups such as Pakistanis, Bangladeshis, Indians, and Filipinos are in fact concentrated in the lower status division of society in their segregation, their everyday life, their living conditions, income and housing etc.

The statistical data concerning education from the Ministry of Education and Culture and the Cyprus Statistical Service does not include any indicators to locate discrimination, racism and xenophobia in the educational system. The available statistical data indicates certain discrepancies in the Ministry's policy implementation. While the Ministry claims to follow a policy of 'desegregating' the schools by dispersing or allocating the minority group of children in several schools and thus prevent notions of ghettoisation, Table 5 disproves the success of such policy. Not only have the numbers of minority children risen slightly at specific schools, there is an inverse relationship between the increased concentrations of students with a specific ethnic minority background correlated to a decreased enrolment of Greek Cypriot pupils in these specific schools.

The Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of

National Minorities (2001) considers that the method of recording national minorities is inadequate as 'there is a possibility that the census data do not reflect the number of persons belonging to national minorities' (point 27). The insistence that groups such as the Maronite's and the Latin's be considered as a religious group and nothing more, rather than a national minority, has been criticised by the Opinion of the Committee. The Advisory Committee is not convinced by the governmental submissions that a set of legal provisions would be superfluous, as there appears to be no cases of discrimination. The Committee encourages the government to implement such legislation, enforcement structures and procedures that would protect all persons from discrimination on the grounds of language, culture, ethnicity and religion.

### **Multiculturalism or Institutional Racism?**

Even before the ECRI Report, Cypriot authorities responded to the presence of non-Greek speakers at schools by developing a 'bi-cultural' educational programme (in Greek: *δια-πολιτισμικό εκπαιδευτικό πρόγραμμα*) for those schools where a high number of non-Greek speaking children appeared. Instead of opting for a comprehensive plan for multicultural education, the plan is for a kind of 'ad hoc multiculturalism from below'.

In one study, analysed further down, (Trimikliniotis, 2001a, p. 27) which was based on interviews with teachers and educationalists actively involved in the design and teacher training of a 'bi-cultural' educational programme it was noted that the schooling structure is not conducive to a genuine response from below, but nonetheless does provide for 'action research'. A deputy headmaster involved in the development of an 'inter-cultural' educational programme at local level noted, 'there is no planning from the Ministry... it is based on the private initiatives of the teachers to find the teaching material and read on their own' (see *ibid.*, pp. 26-28). The idea of the programme however, is not a genuine multicultural approach that recognises and values all cultures, but a practical allocation of teaching time for the non-Greek native speaking children to learn Greek. The presumption is that these children have a language or cultural deficiency and require 'special assistance' in language learning. This teaching is seen merely as an extra curricula activity with no special weight or significance. The Minister of Education insists that there is a very clear educational policy on the matter, however most teachers interviewed in that study stated that if there is such a policy they have never been notified of it (*ibid.*, pp. 26-31).

Ultimately, there is a conflict between the notions of 'inter-cultural education' with the ethnocentric core of the educational system. In fact the former Education Minister, although quite adamant about the need for 'bi-cultural education', rejected

vehemently any move to create a genuine multicultural system that treated all cultures as equal and valuable stating that he would never even consider taking steps to 'discolour Cypriot education, since Greek children of Cyprus need to know who they are and where they must go' (quoted in Trimikliniotis, 2001a, pp. 30-31). The scope for 'inter-cultural education', however, is confined to a school-wide or micro-level and not at a level of macro planning (see Zikas, 2004).

Even with the knowledge that education is not a mechanistic model of reproduction and instruction, with pupils and students acting as passive recipients, but a negotiated, contested and active process (Willis, 1977), Helleno-centricism and nationalism in schools certainly influences the production and reproduction of stereotypes and ideas. Education is indeed ideologically and nationally 'coloured' very strongly indeed and as Spyrou (2000) vividly illustrates the essentialisation of identity occurs through a process of discursive construction, which mythologizes the past and constructs the 'other' in a demeaning and derogatory manner. In his research, Spyrou cites numerous examples where teachers, in the course of history lessons, identify 'Us' with the 'glorious' Byzantine empire, and contrast 'Us', who are 'peace-loving' to 'Them' (i.e., the Turks), who are 'barbarians', 'wild' and 'war-like'. In such a context the idea of respecting other cultures and valuing other identities as equals disappears into thin air.

The educational system of Cyprus may declare on the one hand that it is based on humanistic, liberal and universal principles such as 'freedom, democracy, equality, justice and international understanding' as set out by UNESCO, but at the same time it aspires to transmit, conserve and enhance the 'Helleno-Christian' or 'Helleno-orthodox' values. The latter leaves little, if any, scope for other religions or indeed any questioning of these value-systems. Children from the recognised 'religious groups' are exempted from the lessons of religious education, and parents of other sects or even keen parents who object to the religious teaching may seek permission to have their children excepted from this lesson. Nonetheless there is little scope for pupils and children themselves questioning or challenging the fundamental value system that is the cement of the Greek-Cypriot educational ideology.

Discrimination, therefore, based on religious belief (or cultural practice) is inherent in the system, as the exception practice does not resolve the problem, though it may alleviate some daily pressures. The 'Helleno-Christian' ideals spill over and are dispersed throughout the educational environment. The practice of Morning Prayer is a systematic feature and those students of a different belief or background may be, and often are singled out. Other lessons, one can say key lessons, which aim at developing the critical mind, knowledge, understanding and judgement, such as Modern Greek (language and literature) as well as History and



other lessons have curricula loaded with ethno-religious biases. National celebrations and anniversaries often have a religious bias also: The most important school celebration is March, 25<sup>th</sup>, the day of Virgin Mary and the anniversary of the 1821 Greek revolution. However, this day is the national day of the school parades, when the top pupil is invited to be the 'flag-carrier' (*σημαιοφόρος*), the Greek and the Cypriot flag. However, what will happen if the top student happens to be non-Greek or non-Christian? Would he or she be invited to carry the Greek flag with the cross on it? If the teachers interviewed are correct and the non-Greek students are of the calibre to make them top class students (Trimikliniotis, 2001a), we must conclude that this is likely to occur soon. Such an incident occurred in a Greek village recently and sparked a bitter debate in that community: The parents were divided, as some teachers and parents strongly objected to a Muslim flag-carrier supporting the flag that depicts the Orthodox cross of Greek-ness. This may appear quite simple for European 'civic nations' who practice tolerance and multi-ethnicity, but such tolerance is not always abundant in Cyprus. In any case why should a child be faced with such dilemmas in the first place? It is undoubtedly discriminatory to single out and possibly stigmatise any person of a different ethnic, religious or cultural background. Given that in Cyprus education is communally organized, such problems are inherent: discrimination unfortunately strikes at the heart of the system. However, even secular societies such as France may well impose a kind of *authoritarian republicanism* as indicated in the recent cases where girls expressed their wish to wear the 'hijab' to school.<sup>17</sup>

### **Structural Racism at Elementary Schools**

A study on the primary education of the children of Pontian migrants examined the kind of issues facing them and found serious and systematic processes that discriminated against them (Trimikliniotis, 2001a). It is ironic that the terms of reference of this study were *loaded* with the kind of racial prejudice that the findings eventually strongly criticise. From the Minutes of the meeting of the Parents Association that requested and sponsored the Association of Cypriot Sociologists to conduct the above-mentioned study, apparent are a number of racial stereotypes and attitudes of hostility and mistrust towards the Pontian migrants and their children: In areas with a high concentration of Pontians, the Parents' Associations complained that the promise by the Minister of Education to disperse Pontian children among different classrooms so that there are a maximum of only five per class, has not been kept. This, the parents allege, has resulted in an inability for these children to cover the syllabus due to language difficulties. As a consequence, 'Cypriot children's educational attainment suffers'. Secondly, they allege that due to these problems, Cypriot parents enrol their children in other schools, leaving certain schools in a state of 'imbalance' (i.e., high number of non-Cypriots). Thirdly, Pontians apparently concentrate in poorer areas where rent is more affordable and

so they are ghettoised in neighbourhoods and at school. Also, they allege, there is a tendency toward criminal behaviour in the children of Pontians who, due to their problems at school, drop out of school and resort to criminal acts (see *ibid.*, 2001a, pp. 54-55). However, such behaviour is not attributed only to migrant workers, but to young 'ghettoised' Cypriots who reside in blocks of flats designed as camps for the displaced Greek-Cypriot persons from the 1974 war (Frederic College Report, 2002). Apparently these groups of youngsters are viewed with suspicion and prejudice from the wider society, as are impoverished migrants who also reside in poor estates at different locations (see report *Phileleftheros*, 27 March 2001; Frederic College Report, 2002).

The Study on the Pontian elementary education (Trimikliniotis, 2001a), involved three schools with a high concentration of Pontian children: in Lemesos, Lefkosia and Pafos. The study found that the manner in which this community migrated and settled in Cyprus is indicative of the absence of Government policy with regard to the concentration of these groups in specific areas, the lack of planning and the lack of relevant in-depth research as to how to offer a support infrastructure and how to combat racism.

With regard to non-Cypriot children, the educational problems raised are the result of both the lack of a comprehensive and systematic policy on the question of multi-culturalism as well as a lack of the necessary infrastructure. Teachers do not seem to have the essential training and teaching material to offer a genuine multi-cultural education even when they are keen to do so.

The following issues have been raised by the teachers as regards the elementary education of Pontians, which may well be generalised to include other migrant communities: it seems that the knowledge and experiences (linguistic, cultural etc.) of migrant children in particular, are not considered to be of any value or worth nurturing, a matter which clearly shows the institutional discrimination of the teachers of the hegemonic culture to recognise and, therefore, build upon those cultural experiences for educational purposes. There seems to be a social segregation of the children themselves who 'naturally choose' to socialise with peers of a similar linguistic and cultural background. Parents of migrant children, particularly Pontian parents, do not seem to trust the education authorities and therefore do not maintain the necessary contact with the teachers on the progress of their children.

It was found in the above study that problems exist in the classroom regarding the quality of education, even where the numbers of non-native Greek speakers are relatively 'high'. The only difficulties faced by migrant children in the early classes, exist within Greek language and arithmetic lessons, which are taught separately in

any case. However, wherever there was a rise in the numbers of non-native Greek speakers in a particular class, Greek-Cypriot parents requested that their children be moved to another class or even to *another* school.

According to the evidence provided by teachers, school attainment of Greek-Cypriot students does not seem to be affected negatively by sharing the same classes with non-native speakers. In any event, teachers noticed that despite the difficulties and prejudices that certainly exist, the attainment of migrant children is not lower than that of Greek speakers. Teachers also noted that the only difficulty that migrants may have is related to the fact that the current learning environment might not be properly related to their previous knowledge and interests. This is, of course, the impression of those teachers interviewed and not the result of a systematic and comparative analysis of figures, grades and other relevant material.

There appeared to be some problems of discrimination and racism between children and by certain teachers but there is no system in place to properly monitor the extent of the problem. The head-teachers of the schools studied gave their assurances that there is no such problem, however a number of specific incidents of racial abuse and some minor allegations of discriminatory practices were mentioned. In any case, it would have been rather unnatural to expect that the attitudes prevalent in society at large would not be reflected in the school environment and given that there is no anti-racist programme at the school nor any special training for teachers, one would expect discrimination of different sorts to take place. From the three schools studied, the school in Pafos faced most difficulties due to the fact that there exists in the local community a climate of antipathy and xenophobia towards Pontians in particular and this is reflected in the school.

A clear example of the way in which the communities treat the Pontian migrants is the manner in which they are often referred to as '*Russian-Pontians*' (In Greek: *Ρωσσοπόντιοι*), a phrase that Pontians find quite offensive. The teachers interviewed in this study used the term '*Russian-Pontians*' many times and some of them went on to say that for all they knew these people could be from Russia, yet claim to be Pontians in order to gain entry into Cyprus, but there is no way of checking this claim, which illustrates a suspicion that perhaps they are in Cyprus illegally<sup>18</sup> (Trimikliniotis, 2001a).

As far as the question of violence in elementary schools is concerned, teachers and headmasters concurred that there is no such problem and that, if anything, it is the Cypriot children who are more violent. Finally it was found that one of the major problems facing Pontian children is the fact that their living conditions are poor, they are housed in ghettoised communities and generally their contact with the Cypriot

community is minimum.

However, the attitudes of teachers as regards migrants vary considerably across the board. In the study by Frederic College it was found that teachers and head-teachers, were more xenophobic than their students. The findings surprised the researchers who, if anything, were more biased in favour of teachers and head teachers because they had been in those posts for years. In a survey conducted as part of this study, where they were asked '*if discrimination was ever justified*, it was found that 67% and 68% respectively said it is '*sometimes*' justified, whilst a significant number of teachers and head-teachers considered the causes of discrimination to be due to the behaviour of the minority groups themselves. However, these findings are only based on the impression of the teachers interviewed; they do not reflect a wider survey of teachers or any comparative examination of educational attainment, and therefore need to be considered with caution. Nonetheless, the study deliberately collected data from schools with a high percentage of children of migrant workers.

### **Education: Further Research**

So far we have no access to data on the extent to which there are differential patterns of access to higher education of children of migrants, who have been naturalised as Cypriot citizens. The reason for this is firstly that the presence of migrants is a very recent phenomenon and secondly, that the vast majority of migrant workers are in Cyprus on a short-term basis, but research on this question would be extremely valuable. Educational policy on the question of minority and migrant persons requires closer analysis, particularly if one examines the attitudes of migrant parents and children themselves. Research on the question of ethnic and social background and educational attainment is also another subject needing further research. No research has been carried out at secondary level, or college and university level on the issue of migration, discrimination and attainment; such studies would be extremely valuable. Furthermore, an interesting study would be a comparative study of the Greek-Cypriot and Turkish-Cypriot educational systems as regards the policies and practices to minority and migrant communities (Christophides and Pashiardis, 2001).

### **Final Word**

The role of education is crucial in the production and reproduction of inequality, intolerance and social division, as it is crucial to their alleviation and even elimination. Of course matters are never simple: The dialectic between struggle against inequality in an increasingly multi-cultural society is becoming one of the key challenges for the future of Cyprus: Anti-discrimination, equality and tolerance

are key values and policy goals of a modern democratic educational system. If Cyprus is to approach a society that is open, democratic and tolerant it ought to address the question of discrimination and ethnocentrism inherent in the educational system - not just for the sake of Europe. For a solution of the Cyprus problem to work, we require a sound educational system that tackles racism, discrimination and intolerance effectively and promotes the values of equality, tolerance, justice and recognition of difference. Educational reform is imperative in order to fashion an education system capable of fulfilling a progressive and emancipatory function rather than reproducing and deepening inequality and discrimination in society. However, in order to inform policy-makers we badly need policy-orientated research, which makes the subject of racial, ethnic and religious discrimination in education, as required by the Law transposing the *acquis* 19 (Directive, 43/2000), the direct subject of investigation.

**Table 1: Primary Schools (by town) where children whose native language is not Greek- Year 2001-2002**

Lefkosia	235
Lemesos	Over 50
Larnaca-Ammohostos	92
Pafos	568
Total	Over 935

[Source: Ministry of Education, collected by Maria Rousou. Total number of students **63.800**]

**Table 2: List of Elementary Education Schools with foreign language speaking children**

Name of School	No. of Children
A. NICOSIA	
Phaneromeni	80*
Ayios Dhometios B' (KA' + KB')	42
Ayios Dhometios Γ'	20
Pallouriotissa A' (KA' + KB')	30
Pallouriotissa B' (KA' + KB')	15
Pallouriotissa Γ'.	7
Kaimakli A' + B'	15
Engomi A' (KA' + KB')	25

[\*For the year 2003-2004 the figure is 128]

#### B. LIMASSOL

B' Elementary School	More than 10 foreign
Στ' Elementary School	language speaking
ΙΓ' Elementary School	children go to each of
A' Elementary School	these schools
E' Elementary School	

#### C. LARNACA-FAMAGUSTA

Kalogeras Elementary School (KA' + KB')	47
Ayia Napa	15
Paralimni Δ'	30

D. PAFOS

Pafos A'	10
Pafos B'	20
Pafos Γ'	51
Pafos Δ'	112*
Pafos E'	47
Pafos ΣΤ'	131**
Pafos Ζ'	69***
Pafos Η'	14
Pafos Θ'	47
Pafos Ι'	25
Pafos ΙΑ'	42

[Source: Ministry of Education and Culture. These tables and data demonstrate the size of the minority groups of the various communities in Cyprus. For the year 2003-2004 the figures are: \*132, \*\*2004, \*\*\*77, which indicate that the trend of concentration in certain schools continues to grow within these specific schools]

**Table 3: Children from the Religious Groups, by level and public/private schooling – Year 2000-2001**

LEVEL	PRIMARY		SECONDARY	
	Public	Private	Public	Private
Latins		23		24
Maronites	338	44	123	80
Armenians	129		2	100

[Total number of pupils: 63.800. Source: Framework Convention for the Protection of national Minorities pursuant to Article 25, January 2000]

**Table 4: Number of students enrolled in primary education 2003-2004**

Number of Students					
Number of Students per District	Greek Cypriot Refugees	Greek Cypriot Non Refugees	Turkish Cypriots	Aliens	Total Number
NICOSIA	9547	10440	3	1218	21208
LIMASSOL	5897	9231	49	577	15754
LARNACA – FAMAGUSTA	7707	6872	2	413	14994
PAPHOS	1139	4443	36	950	6568
Total Pancyprrian Number of Students	24290	30986	90	3158	58524

[Source: Ministry of Education and Culture]

**Table 5: Indicative concentration of minority groups in primary education schools**

School	2001	2003
Pafos D'	112	132
Pafos ΣΤ'	131	204
Pafos Ζ'	69	77
Phaneromeni	80	128

[Source: The 2001 and 2003 is offered by the Ministry of Education and Culture]



**Table 6: Enrolment of students in Gymnasium and Lyceum 2003-2004**

	CITY	NATIONALITY											
		GREEK-CYPRIOI	TURKISH-CYPRIOI	ARMENIANS	MARONITES	LATINS	RUSSIANS	GEORGIA	BRITISH	GREECE	ROMANIANS	BULGARIA	ARABS
	NICOSIA	8632	0	6	89	0	16	62	3	129	4	6	4
LYCEUM	LIMASSOL	6677	0	0	0	0	4	21	21	44	2	3	3
	LARNACA	3338	0	0	0	0	2	9	21	66	2	1	2
	FAMAGUSTA	1202	0	0	0	0	1	5	1	4	0	1	0
	PAPHOS	2190	1	5	0	0	17	83	5	24	3	2	1
SUB-TOTAL		22039	1	11	89	0	50	180	51	267	11	13	10
	NICOSIA	9739	2	12	93	3	45	239	16	117	16	16	17
GYMNASIUM	LIMASSOL	8440	4	4	2	0	25	67	2	55	12	8	6
	LARNACA	5316	1	0	1	0	15	68	3	28	5	11	4
	FAMAGUSTA	1499	0	0	0	0	0	7	6	7	2	1	0
	PAPHOS	3081	4	3	0	0	35	269	29	40	8	2	8
SUB-TOTAL		28075	11	19	96	3	120	650	56	247	43	38	35
TOTAL		50114	12	30	185	3	170	830	107	514	54	51	45

--J  
--J

[Source: Ministry of Education and Culture]

**Notes**

\*This paper draws on the report for work-package one, written for the EU funded project under the Sixth Framework Programme, DG Research. It involves a comparative study in eight European countries under the title: *The European Dilemma: Institutional Discrimination and the Politics of Racism*.

1. See Ombudsman Report 2001, ISAG 2003, ECRI 2001.

2. The Ombudsman, vested with power to investigate complaints against the public service and its public officers, including the Police, expressly covers investigation into complaints that acts or omissions violate human rights, and covers thus complaints as to racial or other related forms of discrimination and intolerance.

3. Table of Complaints to the Ombudsman

YEAR	Total Human Rights Complaints	Complaints on Immigration Matters
1996	40	21
1997	97	41
1998		31
1999		84
2000	146	102
2001	199	156

[source: Ombudsman Annual Report, 2002, p. 35]

4. See 'The arrival of the Tsenai phenomenon', **‘Το φαινόμενο Τσενάι μας έρχεται’**, Πολιτής, 2 November 2003.

5. The development, the prospects and problems of the peace movement in Cyprus has been analysed in Trimikliniotis, N. (2000) *The Role of State Processes in the Production and Resolution of 'Ethnic' and 'National' Conflict: The Case of Cyprus*, Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation in Sociology, University of Greenwich, Chapter 3 and 'Conflict Resolution or Rapprochement: Alternative or Complementary Models for Citizens Action in Peacemaking', Conference titled: *Cypriot Society: Continuity and Change*, organised by the Cyprus Association of Sociologists, Intercollege, Nicosia, 17-19 April 2000.

6. The Report is illuminating: 'It is enough to observe that the difficulties in implementing the Treaties began almost immediately after independence... The events which have taken place since December of 1963 have created a situation which makes it impossible to return to the previous situation' (para 129). (See [http://www.cyprus-conflict.net/galo\\_plaza\\_report.htm](http://www.cyprus-conflict.net/galo_plaza_report.htm)).

7. The Report notes: "The violent sharpening of 'national' sentiments over the months of crisis will for some time make it extremely difficult for officials at all levels to impose or even exercise strict impartiality towards all the citizens of the country, and without that impartiality and understanding there will be a constant risk for acts of discrimination, even if laws are respected in the formal sense. Furthermore, there are personal hatreds, which will last beyond any political settlement."

8. This requires a written Statement and approval of the Communal Chamber of such other community, as provided by Art. 2(3). A Greek or a Turkish citizen who wishes to cease to be a member of the community to which he is a member by birth must write and sign a

declaration submitted to the officers of the Republic and the Presidents of the Greek and Turkish chamber [Art. 2(5)(a)].

9. The Communal Chamber of the Community, to which he wishes to belong, must approve this [Art. 2(5)(b)]. Article 7, contrary to any consideration for gender equality, provides that a married woman shall belong to the Community her husband belongs to [Art. 2(7)(a)]. Children are automatically members of their father's community, unless the father is unknown or he/she has been adopted to the community of his/her mother [Art. 2(7)(b)].

10. Whereas a 'minority' is a numerically smaller group of people in comparison to a majority in a State, who retain certain rights relating to identity, religion, schooling, language, a community is endowed with more rights. A 'community' in the sense employed by the Cyprus Constitution is the intermediary between a 'minority' and a 'people'. A community is not a 'people'. The people of Cyprus as set out in the Cyprus Constitution consist of both communities and the other religious minorities. The problem of defining what is community and what rights should be endowed with each community is amongst the most bitterly contested issues in the Cyprus problem.

11. For more about the Armenians in Cyprus, see Ashdjian (2001).

12. Critiques of communitarian nationalism in Cyprus started from the 1970s (Kyriakides, 1968; Loizos, 1972, 1976; Attalides, 1979; Kitromilides, 1977, 1979; Pollis, 1979; Anthias and Ayres, 1978, 1983), very recently there has been a serious intellectual questioning of 'the rigid communitarian norms and conventions that define the parameters of constitutional discourse within which claims to identity are asserted' from the vantage point of a diasporic and post-colonial perspective, utilising the poetics of Cavafy (Constantinou, 1998). Such critiques are extremely useful in the debates over nationhood, racism and identity, as diasporic perspectives that de-essentialise ethnic identity utilising the poetics of the class and the subaltern can open up stale debates and provide for alternative imaginings and futures.

13. The Report of the UN special envoy Mr Galo Plaza in the years 1960-1965 provides an illuminating insight into this period. The Plaza Report refers to the underlying ethnic divisions and the failure to properly protect individual human rights, such as the right to not be discriminated against. Under the heading 'The protection of individual and minority rights', Mr. Plaza notes the difficulty in applying the principle of equality of treatment and human rights without discrimination due to 'the fact that the population of the island continues to consist of two principal ethnic communities, the further fact that they are unequal in numbers and finally the gravity of the conflict which has developed between them'. The same Report noted the difficulty of the task of rebuilding a 'progressive re-birth of confidence and the re-establishment of social peace', as the obstacles 'are no less psychological than political'. The way forward, according to the Report, is 'the establishment of the most rigorous guarantees of human rights and safeguards against discrimination', which goes to illustrate, if in an indirect manner, the prevalence of discriminatory practices that inevitably go hand-in-hand with the ethnic conflict and turbulence that existed, particularly during the period 1963- 1967, throughout the short life of the Cyprus Republic. One can expect to see widespread discriminatory practices, even if there is no study that illustrates this given the collapse of the Republic that was brought about by the Zurich - London accords (see Trimikliniotis, 2003).

14. Nonetheless, it is extremely valuable to attempt to view racism in Cyprus *within* the nationalist/ethnic conflict in an historical perspective in order to examine: (a) the links in the discourse of racism and nationalism, and particularly to view how these are articulated in the political arena; (b) the way in which the discourses and ideologies of nationalism develop

over time, particularly how continuities and ruptures of belonging and exclusion materialise in specific contexts; and (c) whether there is a process of 'transformation' of nationalism into racism and vice-a-versa.

15. He was Director until 1986.

16. See for example Trimikliniotis, N. (2001) *The Educational Problems of the Pontians in Cyprus: Preliminary Research and Report on Primary Education*, Report on behalf of the Cyprus Association of Sociologists submitted to the Ministry of Education 2001.

17. For a discussion on the recent debate over the head scarf see Lloyd, 1993; Webner and Yuval-Davies, 1999; Sahgal and Yuval-Davies, 1992; Dimoulis, 2002.

18. The Pontians were given permit to come to Cyprus as Greek citizens and therefore do not count in the statistics of 'foreign or alien workers'.

19. For an analysis of how Cyprus Law deals with discrimination as provided by the two EU directives 43/2000 and 78/2000 see Trimikliniotis, 2003. This report was written as part of a study into measures to combat discrimination in the candidate countries, funded by the European Community action programme to combat discrimination. The study, coordinated by MEDE European Consultancy and MPG, covers 13 countries. A summary of all reports and a comparison of the law in the 13 countries can be found in the publication *Equality, Diversity and Enlargement*.

## Bibliography

### Reports and Authorities

Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (2001) *Opinion*, adopted on 6 April 2001.

Commission of the European Communities (2002) *2002 Regular Report on Cyprus's Progress Towards Accession*, Brussels, 2 October 2002, SEC(2002) 1401.

Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (2001) Concluding Observations of the Committee in Consideration of the Reports Submitted by States Parties Under Article 9 of the Convention, CERD/C/59/Misc. 15/Rev.2, 8 August 2001.

ECRI (2000) *Report on Cyprus*, European Commission against Racism and Intolerance, Council of Europe, Strasbourg, 9 November 1999.

ECRI (2001) *Second Report on Cyprus*, European Commission against Racism and Intolerance, Council of Europe, Strasbourg, 3 July 2001.

House of Representatives (1997a) *Report of the Parliamentary Commission on Employment and Social Insurance*, 1) The Uncontrolled Presence of foreign Workers in Cyprus and the problems that are created as a result of the absence of a relevant legal framework which must regulate their presence in our country; 2) 'The cultural and social needs of foreigners, men and women, who are working in Cyprus' and 3) 'Foreign workers'.

House of Representatives (1997b) *Report of the Parliamentary Commission on Human Rights* titled: 'The Observing of the Human Rights of Aliens who Arrive Illegally to Cyprus to seek Employment or with the intention of Seeking Political Asylum'.

Ministry of Justice and Public Order (2002) National Report of the Republic of Cyprus on the Implementation of the Conclusions of the European and World Conferences against Racism, Republic of Cyprus, Nicosia, Cyprus.

Ombudsman Annual Report (2002) [Επίτροπος Διοικήσεως], *Ετήσια Έκθεση 2001*,

October.

PEO (2002) *Trade Union Theses on the employment of migrant workers in Cyprus*, September.

Plaza Report on Cyprus (1965) *Report of the United Nations Mediator on Cyprus to the Secretary-General*.

Trimikliniotis, N. (2003) Report on Measures to Combat Discrimination in the 13 Candidate Countries: A Comparison between council Directives and national legislation on the grounds of racial or ethnic origin, gender, sexual orientation, disabilities, age, religion or belief - Report on Cyprus, 2003. Coordinated by MEDE European Consultancy and MPG for the EU Commission (<http://www.migpolgroup.com/publications/>).

### Books, Articles and Papers

Anthias, F. (1987) 'Cyprus', Clarke, C. and Payne, T. (ed.), *Politics, Security and Development in Small States*. Allen and Unwin, London.

Anthias, F. (1989) 'Women and Nationalism in Cyprus', Yuval-Davis, N. and Anthias, F. (ed.), *Woman, Nation-State*. Macmillan, London.

Anthias, F., and Ayres, R. (1978) 'National Liberation and the Struggle for Socialism -The Case of Cyprus', *Capital and Class*, Special Edition of Conference, Vol. 1. Anthias, F. and Ayres, R. (1983) 'Ethnicity and Class in Cyprus', *Race and Class*, Vol. 25, No.1.

Anthias, F. and Yuval-Davies, N. (1992) *Racialised Boundaries*. Routledge, London.

Aristotle (1955) *Ethics*. Penguin Books.

Ashdjian, A. (2001) 'The Armenian Community of Cyprus - Its Structures' (in Greek), (<http://www.hayem.org/articles>).

Attalides, M. (1979) *Cyprus, Nationalism and International Politics*. Q Press, Edinburgh.

E. E. (1986) 'Protracted Social Conflicts: An Analytical Framework', Azar, E. E. and Burton, J. W., *International Conflict Resolution: Theory and Practice*. Wheatsheaf Books, pp. 5-17.

Bourdieu, P. and Passeron, J.-C. (1977) *Reproduction in Education, Society and Culture*. Sage, London.

Bowles, S. and Gintis, H. (1976) *Schooling in Capitalist America*. Routledge, London.

Bulmer, M. and Solomos, J. (1996) 'Race, Ethnicity and Curriculum'. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, Vol. 19, No. 4, pp. 277-288.

Christophi, Chr. (2000) 'Labour Law', Campbell, C. (ed.), *Introduction to Cyprus Law*. (Andreas Neocleous and Co.), Yorkhill Law Publishing, pp. 773-806.

Christophidis, L. and Pashiardis, P. (2001) *The Labour Market in Cyprus, Migrant Workers and Structural Problems*. University of Cyprus, December 2001.

Constantinou, M. (1998) 'The Cavafian Poetic of Diasporic Constitutionalism: Toward a Neo-Hellenistic Decentering of Kyp(riot) Experience', Calotychos, V. (ed.), *Cyprus and Its People, Nation, Identity, and Experience in an Unimaginable Community, 1995-1997*. Westview Press, Oxford.

Dale, G. (1999a) 'Introduction', Dale, G. and Cole, M. (ed.), *The European Union and Migrant Labour*. Berg, Oxford, pp.1-14.

Dale, G. (1999b) 'Germany: Nation and Immigration', Dale, G. and Cole, M. (ed.), *The European Union and Migrant Labour*. Berg, Oxford, pp.1-14.

Dickstein, J. (2001) "'Portrait of a Jew": Ethnic Identity and National Belonging in Cyprus', *The Cyprus Review*, Vol. 11, No. 2, (Autumn), pp. 83-94.

- Foucault, M. (1972) *The Archaeology of Knowledge*. Tavistock, London.
- Frederic College Report (2001) Anti-social Behaviour of Cypriot Youth - Racist Tendencies [Αντικοινωνική συμπεριφορά των Νέων – Ρατσιστικές Τάσεις], 3 Vol. study, (ed.), Harakis, Christis, forthcoming publication.
- Grecos, C. (1991) *Κυπριακή Ιστορία* (Cypriot History). Nicosia, Cyprus.
- Harris, N. (1999) 'The Freedom to Move', Dale, G. and Cole, M. (ed.), *The European Union and Migrant Labour*. Berg, Oxford, pp. 265-280.
- Halsey, A. H., Heath, A. F. and Ridge, J.M. (1980) *Origins and Destinations: Family, Class and Education in Modern Britain*. Clarendon Press, Oxford.
- Hamilton, P. (1995) 'The Enlightenment and the Birth of Social Sciences', Hall, S., Held, D., Hubert, D. and Thompson, K. (ed.), *Modernity - An Introduction to Modern Societies*. Open University Press, Cambridge.
- Intercollege Report (2002) *Strategy Formulation With Regard to Employment of Foreign Workers*, Report for Ministry of Labour, by the research team consisting of Trimikliniotis, N., Theophanous, A., Pantelides, P., Christodoulides, G. and Aristidou, I.
- Kadir, N. (2001) A Preliminary Report: Labour Conditions of Asian Domestic Workers, Fulbright, (unpublished).
- Karagiorges, A. (1986) *Education Development in Cyprus 1960-1977*, Nicosia.
- Kitromilides, P. (1977) 'From Coexistence to Confrontation: The Dynamics of Ethnic Conflict in Cyprus', Attalides, A. (ed.), *Cyprus Reviewed*, Nicosia, Cyprus.
- Kitromilides, P. (1979) 'The Dialectic of Intolerance: Ideological Dimensions of Ethnic Conflict', Worsley, P. and Kitromilides, P. (ed.), *Small States in the Modern World: Conditions for their Survival*, Revised Edition. New Cyprus Association and Cyprus Geographical Association, Nicosia, Cyprus.
- Kyle, K. (1997) 'Cyprus: In Search for Peace', *Minority Rights Group International Report*. Minority Rights Group, UK.
- Kyriakides, S. (1969) *Cyprus: Constitutionalism and Crisis Government*. University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Kyrris, C. (1977) Peaceful Coexistence in Cyprus Under the British Rule (1879-1979) and After Independence. Public Information Office, Lefkosia, Cyprus.
- Kyrris, C. (1996) *History of Cyprus*. Lampousa Publications, Lefkosia, Cyprus.
- Lloyd, C. (1993) 'Universalism and Difference: The Crisis of Anti-Racism in the UK and France' in Rattansi, A. and Westwood, S. (ed.), *Racism, Modern and Identity*, Polity press, Cambridge, pp. 222-243.
- Loizos, P. (1972) 'Aspects of Pluralism in Cyprus', Loizos, P. (2001) *Unofficial Views, Cyprus: Society and Politics*. Intercollege Press, Cyprus.
- Loizos, P. (1976) 'Cyprus: Part Two: An Alternative Analysis'. *Minority Rights Group, Report No. 30*.
- Lombardi, F. (1971) *Ιδέε Pedagogiche di Antonio Gramsci* (Greek translation, napaTT]pT]TT]c;, Thessaloniki, 1986).
- Marshall, T. H. (1992) 'Citizenship and Social Class' in Marshall, T. H. and Bottomore, T. (ed.), *Citizenship and Social Class*. Pluto Press, pp. 1-51.
- Matsis, S. and Charalambous, A. (1993) 'The Demand and Supply Dimensions of the Labour Market: The Issue of Foreign Labour' in Demetriades, E. I., Khoury, N. F. and Matsis, S., *Labour Utilization and Income Distribution in Cyprus*. Department of Statistics and Research, Ministry of Finance, Nicosia, Cyprus, pp. 23-54.

- McPherson, W. (1999) *The Stephen Lawrence Inquiry, Report of an Inquiry by Sir William McPherson of Cluny*, Presented to Parliament by the Secretary of State for the Home Department by Command of Her Majesty, February 1999, The Stationary Office (<http://www.archive.official-documents.co.uk/document/cm42/4262/4262.htm>).
- Papadakis, Y. (1993) Perceptions of History and Collective: A Study of Contemporary Greek Cypriot and Turkish Cypriot Nationalism. Unpublished PhD Thesis.
- Persianis, P. (1978) *Church and State in Cyprus Education*. Violaris Printing Works Ltd., Nicosia.
- Petrillo, A. (1999) 'Farewell to "Bel Paese?"', Dale, G. and Cole, M. (ed.), *The European Union and Migrant Labour*. Berg, Oxford.
- Pollis, A. (1979) 'Colonialism and Neo-colonialism: Determinants of Ethnic Conflict in Cyprus', Worsley, P. and Kitromilides, P. (ed.), *Small States in the Modern World: Conditions for their Survival*, Revised Edition. New Cyprus Association and Cyprus Geographical Association, Nicosia, Cyprus.
- Poulantzas, N. (1978) *Classes in Contemporary Capitalism*, London, Verso.
- Sahgal, G. and Yuval-Davies, N. (eds.), (1992) *Refusing Holy Orders: Women and Fundamentalism in Britain*. Virago Press, London.
- Senseng-Dabbous, E. (1999) 'Social Democracy in One Country: Immigration and Minority Policy in Austria', Dale, G. and Cole, M. (ed.), *The European Union and Migrant Labour*. Berg, Oxford.
- Simon, J. (1989) *The Economic Consequences of Immigration*. Blackwell, Oxford.
- Spyrou, S. (2000) 'Education, Ideology and the National Self: The Social Practice of Identity Construction in the Classroom', *The Cyprus Review*, Vol. 12, No. 1, (Spring), pp. 61-81.
- Trimikliniotis, N. (1999) 'New Migration and Racism in Cyprus: The Racialisation of Migrant Workers', Anthias, F. and Lazarides, G. (ed.), *Into the Margins: Exclusion and Migration in Southern Europe*. Ashgate Press, Avebury.
- Trimikliniotis, N. (2000a) The Role of State Processes in the Production and Resolution of 'Ethnic' and 'National' Conflict: The Case of Cyprus, Unpublished PhD dissertation in Sociology, University of Greenwich.
- Trimikliniotis, N. (2000b) 'Conflict Resolution or Rapprochement: Alternative or Complementary Models for Citizens Action in Peacemaking', Conference titled: *Cypriot Society: Continuity and Change*, organised by the Cyprus Association of Sociologists, Intercollege, Nicosia, 17-19 April 2000.
- Trimikliniotis, N. (2001c) 'Europeanisation and Modernisation: Locating Cyprus in the Southern European Context', *The Cyprus Review*, Vol. 13, No. 2, (Fall), pp. 47-74.
- Trimikliniotis, N. (2003) Report on Measures to Combat Discrimination in the 13 Candidate Countries: A Comparison Between Council Directives and National Legislation on the Grounds of Racial or Ethnic Origin, Gender, Sexual Orientation, Disabilities, Age, Religion or Belief - Report on Cyprus, author on Cyprus Report for EU Commission report on behalf of MEDE Consultancies and the Migration Policy Group.
- Trimikliniotis, N. (forthcoming) *A New Strategy For the Employment of Migrant Workers in Cyprus*, Nicosia, Cyprus.
- Webner, P. and Yuval-Davies, N. (1999) 'Introduction: Women and the New Discourse on Citizenship', Webner, P. and Yuval-Davies, N. (ed.), *Women, Citizenship and Difference*. Zed Books, London and New York.
- Williams, G. A. (2000) 'The Gypsies of Cyprus: A DRC Update', *Kurri*, March Vol. 1, No. 2,

(Spring/Summer), Dom Research Centre.

Willis, P. (1997) *Learning to Labour*. Fanbourn, Saxon House.

### Greek Bibliography

- Apple, M. (1986) *Ιδεολογία και Αναλτικά Προγράμματα*, Εκδ. Παρατηρητής, Θεσσαλονίκη.
- Dimoulis, D. [Δημούλης, Δ.] (2002) *Το Δίκαιο της Πολιτικής, Ελληνικά Πράγματα*, Αθήνα.
- Εταιρεία Μελέτης Νέου Ελληνισμού, *Η Διδασκαλία της Ιστορίας στη Μέση Εκπαίδευση*, (1988) Διήμερο Συζητήσεων, Αθήνα, 9 και 10 Μαΐου 1986, Εκδ. Γρηγόρη. Αθήνα.
- Kantartzi, E. [Κανταρτζή, Ε.] (2003) *Τα Στερεότυπα του Ρόλου των Φήλων στα Σχολικά Εγχειρίδια του Δημοτικού Σχολείου*, Εκδ. Α/φοί Κυπριακίδη.
- Karamesini, M. (1999) 'Informal Employment and the Role of the State in the Greek Labour Market', [Καραμεσίνη, Μ. (1999) «Άτυπη απασχόληση και ο ρόλος του κράτους στην Ελληνική αγορά εργασίας»], *Επιθεώρηση Κοινωνικών ερευνών*, 100, 1999, σελ. 3-32.
- Kokkinos, G. [Κοκκινός, Γ.] (2003) *Επιστήμη, Ιδεολογία, Ταυτότητα: Το μάθημα της Ιστορίας στο αστερισμό της υπερεθνικότητας και της παγκοσμιοποίησης*, Μεταίχμιο.
- Kyrris, C. (1969) *The Gypsies of Cyprus [Οι Ασίγγανοι εν Κύπρω]*, *Μόρφωσις*, September-October-November 1969.
- Kyrris, C. (1985) 'The Mantides of Larnaca' [«Οι Μάντηδες της Λάρνακας»], Rousounides, A. (ed.), *Πρακτικά του Πρώτου Συμποσίου Λαογραφίας (Limassol 20-25 May 1978)*. Lefkosia, Cyprus.
- Lefkis, G. (1984) *Roots [Ρίζες]*. Limassol, Cyprus.
- Loizou, A. N. (2001) *The Constitution of the Republic of Cyprus* [Σύνταγμα Κυπριακής Δημοκρατίας]. Nicosia, Cyprus.
- Maratheftis, M. [Μαραθεύτη, Μ.] (1992) *Το Κυπριακό Εκπαιδευτικό Σύστημα. Σταθμοί και Θέματα*, Λευκωσία.
- Milios, J. [Μηλιός, Γ.] (1984) *Εκπαίδευση και Εξουσία, Θεωρία, Αθήνα*.
- Milios, J. [Μηλιός, Γ.] (2000) *Ο Ελληνικός Κοινωνικός Σχηματισμός, Από τον Επεκτατισμό στην Καπιταλιστική ανάπτυξη*, 2<sup>η</sup> Έκδοση, Κριτική, Αθήνα.
- Persianis, K. I. (1910) *General History of Cyprus [Γενική Ιστορία της Νύσου Κύπρου]* Lefkosia, Cyprus.
- Persianis, P. [Περσιάνης, Π.] (1996) *Η εκπαίδευση της Κύπρου Μπροστά στην Πρόκληση της Ευρώπης*, Λευκωσία.
- Persianis, P., Koutselini, M., and Kefala, M. [Περσιάνης, Π., Κουτσελίνη, Μ., και Κεφάλα, Μ.] (1992) *Κοινωνιολογία της Εκπαίδευσης – Έννοιες και Θέματα*, Παιδογωγικό Ινστιτούτο Κύπρου.
- Persianis, P. K. [Περσιάνης, Π. Κ.] (1996) *Education in Cyprus in the Light of EU Accession* [Η Εκπαίδευση της Κύπρου μπροστά στην Πρόκληση της Ευρώπης]. Lefkosia, Cyprus.
- Polydorou, A. [Πολυδώρου, Α.] (2001) *Εκπαιδευτικά και Κοινωνικοπολιτικά Κείμενα*, Λευκωσία.
- Trimikliniotis, N. (2001a) *The Educational Problems of the Pontians in Cyprus: Preliminary Research and Report*, Report on behalf of the Cyprus Association of Sociologists submitted to the Ministry of Education 2001.
- Trimikliniotis, N. (2001b) 'Τα ΜΜΕ στην Κατασκευή Αντικειμένων Ρατσισμού: Το Παράδειγμα των Οικιακών Βοηθών', *Εξ Υπαρχής*, January 2001.



- Tsiakalos, G. [Τσιάκαλος, Γ.] (2000) *Οδηγός Αντιρατσιστικής Εκπαίδευσης*, Ελληνικά Γράμματα, Αθήνα.
- Φραγκουδάκη, Α. και Δραγώνα Θ. (ed.), (1997) «Τι είν' η πατρίδα μας;», Εθνοκεντρισμός στη εκπαίδευση, 2<sup>η</sup> Έκδοση, Αλεξάνδρεια.
- Χριστοφίδης, Λ. και Πασιαρδής, Π. (2001) «Επιδράσεις των Ξένων εργατών στην Κυπριακή Αγορά εργασίας», έρευνα (παρουσιάστηκε 28 June 2001, Πανεπιστήμιο Κύπρου) *Ο Φιλελεύθερος*, 1 July 2001.
- Zikas, G. (2004) «Προς ένα Διασπαστικό Αναλυτικό Πρόγραμμα», One-day meeting: *Intercultural Education and Antiracist Culture*, 27 March 2004, (<http://www.humanrights-edu-cy.org/projects .htm>).